

**OFFICIAL MEETING MINUTES  
OF THE  
PALM BEACH COUNTY COMMISSION ON ETHICS  
PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA**

**FEBRUARY 3, 2016**

**WEDNESDAY  
1:30 P.M.**

**COMMISSION CHAMBERS  
GOVERNMENTAL CENTER**

**I. CALL TO ORDER**

**II. ROLL CALL**

MEMBERS:

Michael S. Kridel, Chair – Absent  
Clevis Headley, Vice Chair – Absent  
Michael F. Loffredo  
Judy M. Pierman  
Sarah L. Shullman

STAFF:

Mark E. Bannon, Commission on Ethics (COE) Executive Director  
Anthony C. Bennett, COE Senior Investigator I  
Christie E. Kelley, COE Staff Counsel  
Gina A. Levesque, COE Intake Manager

ADMINISTRATIVE STAFF:

Barbara Strickland, Deputy Clerk, Clerk & Comptroller's Office

**III. INTRODUCTORY REMARKS**

Mark Bannon, COE Executive Director, stated that Commissioner Michael Loffredo was acting chair and that a quorum of three was present.

Mr. Bannon requested that cellphones be silenced.

**IV. APPROVAL OF MINUTES FROM DECEMBER 10, 2015**

**MOTION to approve the December 10, 2015, minutes as presented. Motion by Judy Pierman, seconded by Sarah Shullman, and carried 3-0. Clevis Headley, and Michael Kridel absent.**

**RECESS**

**At 1:35 p.m., the chair declared the meeting recessed for an executive session.**

**RECONVENE**

**At 3:30 p.m., the meeting reconvened with Chair Loffredo, Commissioner Pierman, and Commissioner Shullman present. Clevis Headley, and Michael Kridel absent.**

**V. EXECUTIVE SESSION**

**V.A. C15-011**

Commissioner Judy Pierman read the following Public Report and Final Order of Dismissal that was discussed during the executive session:

Complainant, Steven P. Cullen, former Executive Director, Palm Beach County Commission on Ethics (COE), filed the above-referenced complaint on April 16, 2015, alleging that Respondent, Angeleta Gray, former City of Delray Beach Councilwoman, violated Section 2-444(a)(1) of the Palm Beach County Code of Ethics by accepting a gift valued at more than \$100 from a person or entity who is a vendor of the City of Delray Beach and violated Section 2-444(f)(1) by failing to file a copy of her required State of Florida Quarterly Gift Disclosure Form with the COE.

Pursuant to Section 2-258(a) of the Palm Beach County Commission on Ethics Ordinance, the COE is empowered to enforce the Palm Beach County Code of Ethics. On February 3, 2016, the Commission conducted a hearing and reviewed the Memorandum of Inquiry, Report of Investigation, the Affidavit from COE investigative staff, and the Probable Cause Recommendation submitted by the COE Advocate.

**V.A. – CONTINUED**

After oral statements by the Advocate and Respondent, the Commission concluded no probable cause exists to believe a violation occurred as to Count 1 for violation of Section 2-444(a)(1) Gift Law.

Pursuant to Sec. 2-260.3(a) of the Palm Beach County Commission on Ethics Ordinance (Dismissal of Complaints), the alleged violation of Section 2-444(f)(1), Gift reports for officials and employees identified by state law as reporting individuals, is dismissed.

Therefore it is:

ORDERED AND ADJUDGED that the complaint against Respondent Angeleta Gray, is hereby DISMISSED.

DONE AND ORDERED by the Palm Beach County Commission on Ethics in public session on February 3, 2016.

By: Michael F. Loffredo, Acting Chair

(CLERK'S NOTE: The clerk added the language as printed in the Public Report Finding No Probable Cause and Order of Dismissal.)

**VI. PROCESSED ADVISORY OPINIONS (CONSENT AGENDA)**

- a. Request for Opinion (RQO) 15-051**
- b. Request for Opinion (RQO) 16-001**
- c. Request for Opinion (RQO) 16-002**
- d. Request for Opinion (RQO) 16-003**

**MOTION to accept RQO 15-051, RQO 16-001, RQO 16-002, and RQO 16-003 as published. Motion by Judy Pierman, seconded by Sarah Shullman, and carried 3-0. Clevis Headley, and Michael Kridel absent.**

**VII. ITEMS PULLED FROM CONSENT AGENDA – None**

**VIII. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR COMMENTS**

Mr. Bannon stated that:

- The Palm Beach County Bar Association approved Commissioner Sarah Shullman's appointment extension to a full four-year term. Swearing in was set for March 3, 2016.
- The COE anticipated approval from the Association of Police Chiefs of Commissioner Loffredo's extension to a full-term appointment.
- The 2015 COE Annual Report assembled by Christie E. Kelley, COE Staff Counsel and Gina A. Levesque, COE Intake Manager, was published and available to the public. He was grateful to them and to the County Graphics Department staff for their production efforts.
- Prior commitments prevented his attendance at Palm Beach County Day in Tallahassee on January 12-14. This year, the COE was represented by Anthony C. Bennett, COE Senior Investigator I.
- Ms. Levesque attended training sessions in Orlando on January 24-29 to become a certified member of the County's All-Hazard Incident Management Team, which supported local response management teams in natural disasters.
- He, Ms. Levesque and Ms. Kelley planned on volunteering as moderators and judges at the upcoming 2016 High School Ethics Bowl to be held the first week of February at Palm Beach State College (PBSC).
- He and Ms. Kelley planned to attend the Ethics Partnership Council meeting at PBSC on February 4, 2016.

## VIII. – CONTINUED

- Board of County Commissioners (BCC) Mayor Mary Lou Berger was prepared to issue a proclamation at the February 9, 2016, regular BCC meeting declaring March as Ethics Awareness Month. The COE commissioners were asked to inform Ms. Levesque of their intent to attend, so they could be acknowledged at the meeting.
- The COE's five-year-old logo was being redesigned to incorporate aspects of advisory opinions, outreach and training. Initial designs were anticipated to be shown at the March 2016 COE meeting.
- The City of Jacksonville's COE Director Carla Miller sent him an editorial that appeared in the *Florida Times-Union*, which he copied and handed out to commissioners.
  - The piece outlined the State of Florida's Senate and House bills proposing changes to penalties for violations of the public-records law.
  - The law currently required that petitioners' attorneys' fees be paid by the violating government entity.
  - Support in opposition of the bills was sought from ethics commissions statewide.
  - Commissioners were asked to review the newspaper article for discussion at the March 3, 2016, COE meeting and to issue a response to Ms. Miller, prior to the legislature's vote on March 12, 2016.

## IX. COMMISSION COMMENTS

**DISCUSSED:** Appreciation.

Commissioner Pierman thanked Commissioner Loffredo for chairing today's meeting.

X. PUBLIC COMMENTS – None

XI. ADJOURNMENT

At 3:43 p.m., the chair declared the meeting adjourned.

APPROVED:

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Chair/Vice Chair